**ITEM 1: CALL TO ORDER:** Mayor Flaute called the Riverside, Ohio Special Council Meeting to order at 6:00 p.m. at the Riverside Municipal Center Located at 1791 Harshman Road, Riverside, Ohio.

**ITEM 2: PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:** Mayor Flaute led all those in attendance in the pledge of allegiance.

**ITEM 3: ROLL CALL:** Council attendance was as follows: Ms. Campbell, present; Mr. Denning, present; Mr. Fullenkamp, present; Mrs. Reynolds, present; Mr. Schock, present; Deputy Mayor Smith, present; and Mayor Flaute, present.

Staff present was as follows: Bryan Chodkowski, City Manager; Bob Gillian and Tom Garrett, Finance Department.

**ITEM 4: EXCUSE ABSENT MEMBERS:** There were no absent members.

**ITEM 5: ADDITIONS OR CORRECTIONS TO AGENDA:**  There were no additions or corrections to the agenda.

**ITEM 6: APPROVAL OF AGENDA:** A motion was made by Mr. Schock to approve the agenda as submitted. Mr. Denning seconded the motion. All were in favor; none were opposed. **Motion passed.**

**ITEM 7: WORK SESSION ITEMS:**

1. 2012 Operating Budget Discussion

Mr. Chodkowski said in reviewing our projections there were a couple items that were incorrect; they don’t significantly impact the numbers but we wanted to make those corrections. He distributed new work sheets titled Draft #2 and said the changes were highlighted in gray. He also distributed information regarding questions Mrs. Reynolds had earlier related to some fund balances.

Mr. Chodkowski said the budget we prepared is concentrated on operational expenses only and does not take into account any capital equipment needs or capital infrastructure that is proposed; we wanted council to first make a determination on operating before we plug any of that information in. He said this is in concert with the departmental evaluations council went through earlier in the summer and expenses reflect council’s comments from those evaluations. He said he also included his budget notes for reference to some of the more nebulous accounts and beyond those items noted, everything else was based on previous experience or year to date through August 31, 2011.

Mr. Fullenkamp asked for a succinct and clear explanation for the $6.5 Million and the $8.0 Million differential. Mr. Chodkowski said the total cash available to the city is approximately $8.5 Million comprised of several funds not all of which can be used for generalized operations. He said for the purposes of generalized operations, there is roughly $7.5 Million available. He said there are funds we don’t count such as VOCA, Issue II, the Drug Enforcement Forfeiture Funds, etc. because those are for specific purposes and we can’t use them for everyday operations like paying the electric bill. He said these are estimates right now but as we get closer to year end and get further direction from council, the fund balances will change. Mr. Fullenkamp asked why it is projected as $6.5 Million for the beginning of 2012. Mr. Chodkowski said that is specific to the balance of just the General Fund.

Mayor Flaute asked what the other $1.5 Million was. Mr. Chodkowski said when you look at the total reserve for operations: there is $6.5 Million in the General Fund as well as reserves in the Fire Fund, Service Fund, Police Fund, State Highway Fund, Permissive Tax, Center of Flight Fund, etc. Mayor Flaute said don’t we transfer money to the Fire Fund. Mr. Chodkowski said we do. Mayor Flute asked why there was money sitting there. Mr. Gillian said we transfer money as soon as it comes in from the Income Tax Fund to the Police and Fire Funds, irrespective of whether they have a plus balance or not because they are entitled to that money. He said the General Fund transfers are done only if needed to cover their expenses. Mayor Flaute said we do that every year. Mr. Gillian said yes but we transfer it in intermittently and only if the funds don’t have enough to cover expenses. Mayor Flaute asked why there was $1.5 Million. Mr. Gillian said because more income tax money has come in at the moment than what we have expended out and it will probably even out by the end of the year. He said we have transfers programmed in based on estimated shortfalls in the Police, Fire, and Service Funds. Mr. Fullenkamp said so these balances won’t offset the amounts that will need to be transferred from the General Fund. Mr. Gillian said right; if for some reason revenues are higher then we would transfer less and if revenues are lower, we would have to come back to council to ask for permission to transfer more.

Mrs. Reynolds said in looking at the 2012 beginning revenues and using the Fire Fund as an example, it starts with a carry over of $200,000. She asked if the amount transferred in the upcoming budget is reduced. Mr. Gillian said yes; it is used to offset the transfer. Mrs. Reynolds said she did total all the beginning balances for the funds other than the General fund and came up with about $1.5 Million.

Mr. Denning said he went through the budget notes and had some general questions for us to think about. He said the first one is the membership for the MVMAA is $1,500 which he thinks we should be a part of. He asked if that could come out of each member’s travel and training account instead of having a separate line item. Mr. Chodkowski said yes, if council wanted it to.

Deputy Mayor Smith asked if the city belonged to the Miami Valley Military Affairs Association as well. Mr. Chodkowski said yes; he and Mr. Murray are also members and our memberships are paid for out of our respective funds, so it is only the membership of council and council’s expense to attend those events that comes out of this line item.

Mr. Denning said as much as we have in our travel budgets, $2,000 a piece… Mayor Flaute said that’s not very much if you go one place. Mr. Denning said he understood but he just thinks it’s another $1,500, then there are other places, and it’s adding up. He said he knows $1,500 isn’t much in the grand scheme of things but $1,500 here, $2,500 there, and etc. can add up and make a difference. He said it doesn’t bother him to have it come out of his travel money instead – maybe $200 a piece, and if you look at the total of what everybody traveled, we are going to have more than that left over between all of us. He said it would be a group decision and he was trying to come up with ways to help cut expenses.

Mayor Flaute said just so everyone knows, where it says membership to the Mayors & Managers Association; that is free and is not part of the $1,500.

Mr. Denning asked about the CINTAS Rug Service which costs $500 per month. Mr. Chodkowski said the rugs are monogrammed and it is a weekly service. Mayor Flaute asked if that could be done every two weeks. Mr. Chodkowski said keep in mind these are floor mats and it becomes an aesthetic issue; it would require labor and materials for the custodian to clean them. Mr. Denning said that’s still about $125 to $150 per week which still seems pretty high. Mrs. Reynolds asked how many rugs is that per week. Mr. Chodkowski counted 28 total rugs. Mrs. Reynolds said that doesn’t seem unreasonable.

Mr. Denning agreed after hearing the service received. He asked about the records management. Mr. Chodkowski said that is simply storage for quite a number of documents. He said right now we are required to store everything that is an official document and since we became a city documents have only been ordered to be destroyed starting this year. He said we updated our records retention plan which has to be re-approved by the state, then we will be able to fill out record destruction forms and have the documents destroyed. He said there is an expense to that but we are slowly but surely going to begin weeding down that fee. He said so it’s basically $500 per month to store our records. Mr. Denning asked if they picked the boxes up and delivered them if we needed access. Mr. Chodkowski said yes.

Deputy Mayor Smith asked if that included police items the city has to keep that are related to murders. Mr. Chodkowski said no, that is done in-house through the Police Department; there is an evidence locker here as well as secure off-site storage. Deputy Mayor Smith asked if that was under the Police budget and Mr. Chodkowski said yes.

Mr. Denning said the Donnellon/McCarty fees total around $11,000 per year, split among the departments; is that maintenance agreements or based on the number of copies we run. Deputy Mayor Smith asked how many copiers we had. Mr. Chodkowski said there are currently 4 that we actually service and there is a surplus unit that was given to the Historical Society and a surplus unit in storage at Rohrer Park. He said the surplus units still function but they are no longer serviced. Mr. Gillian added that we are still paying off leases on the new units.

Mr. Denning asked about the geese control for Center of Flight. Mr. Chodkowski apologized and said that was a carry over note and the fee is now strictly for weed control; prior to last year we had to have a chemical application made to the grass to make it not tasty to the geese and we supplanted fish in the ponds to eat the algae which was also the attractant.

Mr. Denning said he thought the reason we spent $10,000 in ammo last year was so that we wouldn’t have to buy any this year. Mr. Chodkowski said that was for traditional munitions and the majority of the funds in that category this time are for TASER cartridges and batteries.

Mr. Denning said he was splitting a few hairs but that’s where we are at. He said the other thing he would like for council to think about is their salary; we make $4,000 per year whether we are here or not because we were elected to this position. He said we’ve asked everyone to cut back or stay where they are at and he would like council to consider they only get paid if they come to the meetings. He suggested $100 per meeting with a maximum budget of $3,000 per person. Mr. Fullenkamp asked if that would take a change to the Charter. Mr. Denning said no. Mr. Chodkowski said council may change their wage by ordinance. Mr. Denning said if you increase council’s salary, you have to wait for the next election cycle before it becomes effective; it doesn’t say anything about reducing our salary so we can do that whenever we want. He said if we reduce our salary it would help our budget by $7,000 immediately.

Deputy Mayor Smith said what about the meetings we attend that aren’t council meetings such as the Mayors & Managers meetings the Mayor goes to or the MVRPC meetings he attends to represent the city. Mr. Denning said if you are doing this job for the paycheck, you are doing it for the wrong reason. Deputy Mayor Smith said look at it this way, council members are making $4,000 and the city manager is making 25 times that. Mr. Denning said the city manager is here everyday and takes more than 10 times the stuff we have to take. Deputy Mayor Smith said council members are on duty 24/7/365 and we gave up our right to be a private citizen. Mr. Denning said he understands that but he is not sitting in the audience asking council members to do this; he is asking as a council member and he is willing to make the same sacrifice because we are asking the city employees to not take a raise at all even though the cost of living has gone up or possibly some of them may end up with a cut – we don’t know. He said if we are going to do that or ask our constituents to help us increase our revenue through taxes; we need to show a good faith effort that we are willing to give something up in the process. He said it’s going to take 4 yes votes to get that passed and he’s just asking them to think about it because it will impact the budget. Deputy Mayor Smith said not really. Mayor Flaute said well we haven’t had a raise for 17 years. Mr. Denning said he thought it would be a positive thing.

Mr. Schock said if a council member wants to forfeit their wage, they can and if Mr. Denning want to set precedence, he can do that. He said that would put the guilt on the rest of us to follow suit but he can also see where the Mayor is coming from. He said he has put a lot of time into the community the last 4 years, giving up vacation and taking no-pay days from work just to participate in functions to represent the city. He said $4,000 doesn’t offset the money he’s spent being a public official. He said he can see both points. Mr. Denning said to him it would be good faith to the community when he honestly believes we are going to have to ask them for a way to add revenue to our budget if we want to improve what we are doing.

Deputy Mayor Smith said to make this meeting tonight, he had to give up showing a house at 6:30 p.m. He said if those people choose to go with another realtor, he could be out a couple thousand dollars.

Mr. Fullenkamp said he has never heard one resident complain about council members making $4,000 per year. Mr. Denning said he just wanted to put it out there to think about and if it doesn’t come up again, that’s fine. Ms. Campbell asked what City of Dayton made. Mayor Flaute said $4,500 for mayor and $3,800 for council members. Deputy Mayor Smith said plus they get a car, cell phone, and health care. Mayor Flaute said he would do it if they got health care.

Deputy Mayor Smith said on the revenue side for next year there is about $500,000 less estimated for income tax. He asked if that was due to people getting laid off or moving out of the city or what. Mr. Chodkowski said any combination of those. Deputy Mayor Smith said real estate and personal property tax revenue is also estimated less; is that due to the taxes being adjusted downward. Mr. Chodkowski said yes. Deputy Mayor Smith said he didn’t think that would affect us so soon. Mr. Chodkowski said in addition to evaluations being down, people who are not employed do not have money to pay their property tax and it is a compounding effect.

Ms. Campbell said payments haven’t gone down yet, at least hers hasn’t gone down and she didn’t know about anyone else. Mr. Denning said your tax payment shouldn’t go down because they get the same dollar value.

Deputy Mayor Smith asked if the increase in franchise fees was from the contract with cable TV. Mr. Chodkowski said that is related to the agreement with cable TV and has everything to do with how many people are purchasing the service. Mr. Gillian said that is an estimate based on year to date payments. Deputy Mayor Smith said regarding interest, less money in the bank equals less interest collected, correct? Mr. Chodkowski said yes.

Deputy Mayor Smith said on page 2 in the Service Fund there is less estimated for gasoline tax but gas keeps going up so it seems like we would get more revenue. Mr. Chodkowski said it’s the manufacturer’s price per gallon that’s going up; the gasoline tax is a fixed cents amount. Deputy Mayor Smith said this anticipates people will drive less next year. Mr. Chodkowski said correct but again that is based on year to date. Deputy Mayor Smith said it could also be based on cars with better gas mileage.

Mayor Flaute said on page 1 of the notes regarding $700 for the Dayton Chamber of Commerce; are we really getting $700 worth, he doesn’t attend any of their events and he doesn’t think anyone on council does either. Mr. Chodkowski said his opinion is that for the times we have utilized that membership, such as yesterday’s event, we were recognized and acknowledged. Mayor Flaute asked what yesterday’s event was. Mr. Chodkowski said it was the Dayton Chamber Challenge which is their annual golf fundraiser. He said there were a lot of people that took notice we were there. He said there are a lot of events the Dayton Chamber sponsors such as several legislative breakfasts, several legislative briefings, and they assisted with a discount for his leadership training several years ago. He said he thought for what it is the city is being asked to pay, when we’ve had an opportunity to utilize it, they have been supportive.

Mayor Flaute asked if the Walnut Grove membership was the cheapest available. Mr. Chodkowski said $2,300 is the cheap business membership and is specifically for access to the club’s dining facilities. Mr. Fullenkamp asked how often we used that. Mr. Chodkowski said it depends on the year; some years we have used it quite a bit – anywhere from 20 to 25 times. He said last year maybe a dozen times.

Ms. Campbell said when we have meetings in the smaller rooms, don’t we have to pay for that. Mr. Chodkowski said no; we pay a club minimum every month. He said for instance, if we have someone who is interested in developing in our city and we host them for lunch at the club; if the cost of the lunch is below what our dues for the month cost, that meal is already paid for. Mayor Flaute said we need to utilize that. Ms. Campbell asked if we got a discount for when the club was closed. Mr. Chodkowski said no. Mr. Fullenkamp asked what months of the year they are closed. Mr. Chodkowski said he thought January and February. Mayor Flaute asked if the clerk knew. She said they close right after Christmas through part of March then they open a limited number of days until it gets warm and people start golfing. Mr. Denning said that makes sense to him because there isn’t any reason to pay people to be there if there’s no business. Mayor Flaute said he understood that, it’s just unfortunate that when we need it, it’s not available. Mr. Denning said he did think it is very positive and the best place to take people to. Mayor Flaute agreed and said he was just wondering if that was the cheapest membership.

Mayor Flaute said for the PNC Bank fees of $3,300; don’t we have our $8.0 Million sitting in there. Mr. Chodkowski said not all of it. Mayor Flaute said that sounded like a lot in fees. Mr. Gillian said they charge us separate rates per transaction. Mayor Flaute said even with all our money there. Mr. Gillian said yes. Mr. Schock said we can renegotiate these fees; just tell them if they don’t lower the fees, we’ll go to another bank. Mayor Flaute asked if we’d tried to renegotiate the fees. Mr. Gillian said not since we signed the contract. Mayor Flaute asked if Mr. Gillian would try. He said he appreciated them being in our city and maybe there is something we can do. Mr. Denning said our payroll comes out of there too, so for every check that is done, there is a fee associated with that. Mrs. Reynolds said she really thought this was a cheap bank fee and there is a cost for doing business. She asked if staff had any problems with the bank. Mr. Chodkowski said no. Mr. Gillian said exactly the opposite; they were very helpful in getting our notes turned into bonds and were the only bank that would touch it. He said we would not have been able to place those bonds without them. Mr. Chodkowski said the bank is in business to make money too and if they don’t make it on a transaction fee, they will find somewhere else to make it. Mayor Flaute said he would appreciate Mr. Gillian checking into seeing if there was something else we could do.

Mayor Flaute said on page 3, line item 202.202.5251, $4,400 for cleaning supplies previously unfunded; what is that? Mr. Chodkowski said that is toilet paper, paper towels, window cleaner, antiseptic spray, etc. He said last year we reformatted our budget in a way we hoped would be more accountable in how we spent money and where we spent money. He said after you approved the budget; we received in a case of paper towels and a case of toilet paper and the question was , where do we book these. He said we wound up piecing it apart and finding money in the supplies categories; the reason for the change in that account is it needed a home.

Mayor Flaute said a little further down, line item 202.202.5342, $150,000 to increase salt tonnage per council; why did we ask you to increase that? Mr. Chodkowski said council indicated they were not happy with the ice removal policy on side streets. Deputy Mayor Smith asked if we ever figured out why other cities pay less for their salt than we do. Mr. Chodkowski said he didn’t know; he has the SWOP4G bid sheet and it is all over the board. He said it could depend on how far you are from the source; how much tonnage you are ordering; etc. Deputy Mayor Smith said Kettering’s price was considerably different than ours and they aren’t that much farther from the source. Mr. Chodkowski said some order on demand; some bid a guaranteed amount; and in our instance, we bid a maximum take but we only buy what we need. Mayor Flaute asked if it was still council’s direction to salt the side streets. Council agreed yes; salt the side streets.

Mayor Flaute said next item, $1,000 for a Miami County Landfill permit for animal carcass disposal; why do we take our animals to Miami County? Mr. Chodkowski said because Montgomery County wouldn’t take them. Mayor Flaute asked who took them to Miami County. Mr. Denning said the Service Department and Mr. Chodkowski said correct.

Mrs. Reynolds said for the county jail housing fee of $10,000, is that based on a daily rate. Mr. Chodkowski said yes; it is a per day rate per person and is an estimate.

Mayor Flaute said he knows council entertained the idea of hiring another person in the service department but he’s not really in favor of that unless there is a crisis back there. He said we really cannot afford it unless things are really bad back there. He asked if that was included in this budget. Mr. Chodkowski said yes; this budget accounts for a full-time Fire Chief; refunds the fifth Sergeant position providing for 20 full-time police officers; rehires the vacant full-time Firefighter/Paramedic position; it has money for a full-time Assistant City Manager; and it does have wages/benefits for a full-time laborer in the Service Department. Mayor Flaute asked what this person was going to be doing.

Mrs. Reynolds said we talked about being able to take over the load of doing the man-hole cover repairs rather than going out to have it contracted. She said she thought she remembered Mayor Flaute being concerned about the time taking to get those repaired and that was the conversation we had is that we would pick up those duties. Mr. Chodkowski said you are talking about the water main repairs. Mrs. Reynolds said yes. Mr. Chodkowski said then we will need to look at that number; his understanding was that was for just generalized road maintenance not for the water main repairs.

Mr. Fullenkamp said he sent an email to the City Manager a couple months ago about what the costs and bids were for those repairs and from his recollection, about $25,000 of those repairs was for labor. Mr. Chodkowski said the county sets the rate for what it will pay for materials and the labor becomes the negotiable component; we talked internally about whether or not we wanted to assume the water main repairs because the parts would be paid for and the labor costs would also be subject to payment from the county. He said the trade off for that is we would lose ground maintenance time in the parks and the right of ways and that work would need to be subcontracted out. He said based on the contractor, in most instances that proved to be a positive rate of return in the short term but a negative return in the long term. He said while we talked about it as a possibility to bring in additional revenues in exchange for limited costs, our long term ability to control costs related to the contractor weren’t what we had hoped they were. He said it’s cheaper today to bring on somebody to cut grass; five years from now it will be more expensive to have somebody cut grass for us. Mr. Denning said a subcontractor. Mr. Chodkowski said yes; the subcontractor starts out at a low rate but the price goes up to the point that he becomes so expensive that we can bring in a couple guys at minimum wage; then gas goes up and maintenance goes up and it becomes cheaper again to sub the work out.

Mr. Fullenkamp said if we hire an extra laborer in the service department, what will the public see that is different. Mr. Chodkowski said the plan based on what we have put together and his misunderstanding of council’s comment is that we would become more proactive in our road maintenance: we would have our dura-patcher out more; we would be able to do more cold and warm patches; we would be able to do more catch basin repairs; we would be able to do more crack sealing; etc. He said there are companies that will lend us equipment to do repairs if we buy their product. He said his take from the discussion with council is the added service person would come on to help for that purpose. He said there was some additional discussion on how we divide the work force for snow plowing, ice removal, and mismatched shifts. Mr. Denning said he agreed with the City Manager’s take on this; he thought that’s what was discussed in the original conversation. Mr. Chodkowski said it’s not that we can’t do that; he would just need to go back and look at some of this information.

Mrs. Reynolds said she went back and read the minutes because she wanted to make sure; Mr. Fullenkamp had asked the question and we talked about in-house repairing of the water mains ourselves. She said that was her reason for bringing forth hiring an additional person and it was indicated we would need additional materials/supplies to do that in-house. She said we even talked about $48,000 per year for a laborer; salary and benefits. She said if we aren’t going to be able to provide a service that is cost effective in saving us money; then she wasn’t sure. She said we have a staff now that can handle road services. Mayor Flaute said it’s been that way for 17 years – we’ve had the same amount of people.

Ms. Campbell said when we hire out jobs to mow grass; don’t we have a contract so the rates can’t be raised. Mr. Chodkowski said we have those types of services specific to private property nuisance abatement but we don’t have any large contracts for any of the park complexes; we don’t contract that work out.

Mayor Flaute said if its all right with council, he would like to see some numbers on what we would save getting another person. He said we’ve had the same people back there for 17 years and sometimes the roads can get pretty nasty but part of that is because we haven’t fixed roads for three years. He said that’s why those are getting tougher so if we bring on another person, we’ll fix the roads a little faster but we will also lose enough money that we won’t be able to fix the roads. Mr. Chodkowski said he wouldn’t say that; the issue is that the way we approached this is to begin increasing preventative maintenance. He said that doesn’t mean the roads aren’t going to fall apart because they will; the goal is to delay the decay as long as possible so the longer term solution can be implemented. He said when you look at the total cost to reconstruct a road compared to what a laborer is going to cost, there is a significant disparity.

Deputy Mayor Smith said before we look at maybe hiring additional personnel; what does a laborer do in the winter. He said we have guys that drive the trucks, a guy that drives the backhoe to load the trucks, but what does the laborer do when we are in a snow storm. Mr. Chodkowski said it’s not just limited to snow storms; we do site work, we do drainage work, we do a lot of preventative maintenance, we do a lot of fabricating, etc. Deputy Mayor Smith said he was just curious what the laborer does when the truck driver goes out. Mr. Chodkowski said the truck drivers are laborers. Mayor Flaute said so this laborer could be driving a salt truck and we might not have to pay overtime. Mr. Chodkowski said correct. Deputy Mayor Smith asked why we couldn’t look at part-time people as far as adding on; a 32 hour work week at $10 per hour and no benefits. He said it seems like that would be most cost effective. Mr. Chodkowski said he wasn’t going to argue that point but there were some expressions by members of council that they preferred full-time employment to part-time. He said if it is the will of council to provide part-time employment; he would be more than happy to do that. Deputy Mayor Smith said we had the same thing in the Fire Department where the old fire chief took and used part-timers to fill the full-time position reducing the budget because he didn’t have to pay benefits and he reduced the hourly wage because part-time makes less than full-time. He said he thought that was an excellent idea and he could see how we could do that with the service department.

Mr. Schock said we are sitting and listening to all this work one laborer is going to do; one guy is going to turn this place into an efficient superman. He said Deputy Mayor Smith has a good idea; instead of hiring one full-time person, hire two part-time persons. He asked how many people were in the service department. Mr. Chodkowski said there are 9 laborers, a janitor, and 3 support staff. Mayor Flaute said that’s what we’ve always had and they’ve been doing it that way for 20 years. Mr. Schock said if we had 22 employees in the service department 15 years ago there’s a good possibility Burkhardt wouldn’t be deteriorated so bad because they would have being doing preventative maintenance. Mayor Flaute said we really don’t know the benefit of putting another person on. Mr. Schock said there are more people working on the 168 acre golf course than the city has working in the service department. Mr. Denning said the golf course has more income.

Mr. Fullenkamp said he wasn’t sure $10 per hour, part-time with no benefits was an excellent solution. Mr. Chodkowski said to keep in mind we have very talented staff members that are part-time that are actively seeking full-time employment because they don’t have benefits. He said we are paying them very cheaply, less than $11 per hour, and they will tell you they don’t want more money, they want the benefits.

Ms. Campbell said how many times do you have a job to do with only 4 hours to do it and you don’t want to do it because you don’t have enough time to finish it. Mrs. Reynolds said she didn’t think part-time was the answer for any employee in the city. Mr. Denning said not for the type of job we are trying to get done; if it was just to mow, you can bid it out and have someone mow every two weeks. He said you don’t do that with the talent you are trying to get in and our folks back there aren’t getting any younger, so we need to bring in younger people and get them up to speed and trained so the older guys can retire or go on part-time. He said we need to bring somebody in that would be interested in making this a career and pay them a reasonable amount with benefits so the person can raise a family. He said it would be nice if it were a local person. Mayor Flaute said it would be nice to hire a fireman or policeman too, so is this the most important person to hire. Mr. Chodkowski said the nice thing about the employment pool here is that they all have longevity and because of that, you may have 9 laborers employed but only 7 or 8 here at any given time which is becoming a bigger and bigger issue. He said collective bargaining has given these units some very generous vacation packages and they accumulated significant time to where they can take several weeks off and the city has a use it or lose it policy. He said if you are not going to get paid for the benefit, you are going to use the benefit so you have certain labor deficiencies that exist because of seniority that are at some time going to have to be offset by an addition to the labor force.

Mayor Flaute asked if council wanted to go with full-time or part-time. Mr. Schock said let’s just give them the money and let them decide what to do.

Ms. Campbell asked how many people the City Manager felt he needed. Mayor Flaute said we can’t know that. Mr. Chodkowski said he would say that if you are going to look at having an impact public service is an area you need to look at; council hasn’t increased total staff since the township and the village merged but you did pick up several hundred miles of road and a few hundred acres of property to maintain. He said we are adequate at doing the minimum. He said if you add to the service department, you need to add materials as well which is in the proposed budget. He said when we ran our analysis for police and fire it was adequate to meet our needs for a significantly longer period of time than public service and administrative staff. Ms. Campbell asked if he could, how many more people would he hire in the police, fire, and service departments based on need. Mr. Chodkowski said he would need more time to answer that question; this was prepared based on the direction council gave him. Ms. Campbell said why don’t we get a full amount of people needed and work from there. Mr. Denning said we don’t have enough money to hire 6 people. Ms. Campbell said maybe we can get 2 or 3.

Mr. Schock said Ms. Campbell has a good idea; let the City Manager put up his wish list of what it would take to make improvements instead of being status quo. He said let’s be better than the city next to us. Mr. Denning said the thing left out of the additional stuff they do is once we became a city we had to increase the size of the drainage pipes that are serviced; when you are a township or a village it’s a lot smaller than what you have to service when you are a city. He said we took that on but did not increase the amount of staff to do that; we have been doing that but like the City Manager said we are doing the minimum instead of improving anything. He said there was a repair to a drain by Shellabarger Park that as a township the county would have taken care of it but as a city, we had to do it – 2 or 3 people for 4 or 5 days plus the cost of materials. He said we’ve increased the amount of work and they are talented guys but they are aging and we need to get some new talent in the pool to learn the skills.

Mr. Chodkowski said for a departmental rookie assuming there are no wage rates to the collective bargaining agreement, starting wage for 2,080 hours is $30,534; overtime projected at $2,290; insurance for a family $14,696; PERS contribution of $4,595; medicare/medicade $475; life insurance $58 – approximately $53,300. Ms. Campbell asked what 2 part-time people would cost. Mr. Chodkowski said about $38,000 to $42,000 for both and that would be assuming the labor pool would be significant to where we can pay them $10.50 to $11.00 per hour. Ms. Campbell asked if they would have worker’s comp. Mr. Chodkowski said yes; they would also accumulate sick leave, vacation leave, and pay into PERS. He said they would not be entitled to traditional health insurance. Ms. Campbell said a lot of times when you have part-time people; she didn’t think they took pride in their job. Deputy Mayor Smith said sure they do. Ms. Campbell said not really because they want to work, they want to do a good job, and they need that full-time job with benefits. Ms. Chodkowski said the majority of our part-time workers very much do take pride in their work. Ms. Campbell said do they have another job. Mr. Chodkowski said some do, some don’t; the issue with part-time people is they want to work part-time but they also want to work full-time so you bring them in the door, get them going, and know that they are looking for a job. He said he is aware that out of all our current part-time staff, almost all of them are looking for full-time employment. Deputy Mayor Smith said out of all the people that are laid off right now it would seem the pool to pick from would be pretty large.

Mayor Flaute said he believes he is hearing full-time from council. Mr. Schock said leave it up to the City Manager to choose; they will do what they need to do with it. Mr. Chodkowski said it is a policy issue for council to decide; if it was the case for the City Manager to decide there would be no table of organization.

Ms. Campbell asked if $53,000 was all he could come up with. Mr. Chodkowski said he can come up with whatever amount but $53,000 is what was budgeted. Ms. Campbell said you might need 2 or 3 people. Mr. Chodkowski said if we had the opportunity to sit down and more adequately define the need of our workforce; we could do that if we could justify a significant change. He said the problem is there isn’t enough money to sustain that workforce indefinitely. Ms. Campbell said she thinks council needs to take into account what the City Manager wants.

Mr. Denning suggested hiring one person with the 2012 budget and then for the 2013 budget have the City Manager give council his wish list. He said otherwise we will be here in January still arguing over this budget. He said it’s something to think about for next time; is this one person enough or would it be helpful to have another. Mr. Chodkowski said to keep in mind that a lot of that will be determined and driven by how you decide to solve the revenue deficiency that exists.

Deputy Mayor Smith said on page 1 of expenses, salaries/wages for the City Manager are $8,900 less than last year’s budget; why is that. Mr. Chodkowski said it shows no cost of living increase for any of the existing employees and is at a pay rate less than what the former Assistant City Manager was making.

Mayor Flaute said you do plan to hire another Assistant City Manager. Mr. Chodkowski said yes unless council tells him otherwise. He said he has programmed that because he feels a full-time administrative general is needed. Mr. Schock said he agrees on that and just out of curiosity to refresh our memory, how many jobs does Bryan perform besides City Manager. Mr. Chodkowski said technically he holds 2 titles: City Manager and the Public Safety Director; what he does is everything. Mr. Schock said you are Human Resources too. Mr. Chodkowski said yes; he and Ms. Mehaffy currently split those duties but he is also assigned as Director of Personnel. Mr. Schock said what else. Mr. Chodkowski said he reviews and evaluates all staff reports to the BZA and Planning Commission; he assisted in coordination of the Forest City contract; he is performing all the review and preliminary evaluations on the Brantwood Subdivision project; he is preparing this budget supported by Mr. Gillian; he’s negotiating 3 separate contracts – 1 is active, the other 2 are pending; and we are wrapping up the evaluation and recommendations on the zoning code. Mr. Schock said that’s just an example of how overloaded we have this guy and this is where he hopes we can find enough money in that salaries/wages line item to hire someone capable of stepping right in. He said he kind of thinks the salary is low.

Mayor Flaute asked how much most Assistant City Managers made. Mr. Chodkowski more than what we are going to offer but most of the senior staff makes less than their counterparts throughout the Miami Valley. He said he is hopeful we can find a candidate that will have the basic skills, knowledge, and ability to do the job; specific to Riverside, a person will have to learn. He said he thinks there are qualified candidates out there and it might be harder to find them because of what we are paying; but there are more qualified people that leave the field every month than there are that come into the field. He said we probably won’t get someone to leave a position in Dayton but we will probably find someone from a smaller community up north; keep in mind that the former Assistant City Manager was homegrown talent starting off as a college intern and working her way up. Mr. Denning said she knew Riverside before she knew what the job was.

Mrs. Reynolds asked what his minimum requirements will be for this position. Mr. Chodkowski said he was going to pull those straight from the job description which is a minimum of a Bachelor’s Degree and 3 to 5 years progressive experience. He said those are obviously the ideal qualifications we are going to see. Mrs. Reynolds said preferred or required. Mr. Chodkowski said the degree will be required but the length of experience will be subject to interpretation. Mrs. Reynolds asked what he was looking at for a starting salary. Mr. Chodkowski said from the minimum to the maximum budgeted; mid 30s all the way up to the 50s but in order to get somebody who is going to be an executive officer and be able to serve in my absence, you are going to have to pay closer to the higher end. Mrs. Reynolds said we are probably going to have to look at an additional $20,000 in this salary line. Mr. Chodkowski said $50,000 is budgeted and to go beyond that creates other issues that exist within our current employment structure. Deputy Mayor Smith said we would have to give other people raises like we have in the past. Mr. Chodkowski said it is possible we would need to do that or we would wind up having to replace other staff members at the executive level. Mrs. Reynolds asked if we would be subject to any relocation fees. Mr. Chodkowski said for this position, he did not believe the candidate would be outside of the state.

Deputy Mayor Smith asked how he came up with $8,900 less; there is $50,000 figured in the budget but the former assistant was at $54,000. Mr. Chodkowski said last year’s numbers included wage increases which did not happen there was also some rounding of numbers to accommodate the budget process. He said the numbers are based on what people are actually being paid and mathematically the numbers were verified by Mr. Gillian and Mr. Garrett.

Deputy Mayor Smith said in the Fire Department salaries/wages the budget for 2011 had a Fire Chief figured in and the 2012 budget is $54,300 more than the 2011. Mr. Chodkowski said when we started 2011, we had a Fire Chief so all we did was not re-employ him. He said that is why there isn’t a great discrepancy in those figures. He said we also have had some transition with the full-time firefighters so now you having incoming employees that are being paid at a lower rate as compared to when we programmed the 2011 budget.

Deputy Mayor Smith said we have an increase of $28,700 in Service Department salaries/wages. Mr. Chodkowski said that accounts for the additional laborer. Deputy Mayor Smith said he thought that was $53,000. Mr. Chodkowski said that is total expense: wages, overtime, insurance, etc. He said it is all accounted for and keep in mind we need to revalidate these numbers; this was just put together for the purpose of discussion.

Deputy Mayor Smith said yes but the numbers are way off; for the Police Department salaries/wages are down $76,200 and he knows we chose not to replace a sergeant. Mr. Chodkowski said what you have now is fewer total personnel than you had in years prior. Deputy Mayor Smith said this should just be this year; we are looking at the 2011 budget vs. the 2012 budget and it’s at minus $76,200 which says we are going to pay less in wages next year than we did this year. Mr. Chodkowski said that is correct. Deputy Mayor Smith asked if that was because we had officer retire or quit and we are bringing in new ones at less pay. Mr. Chodkowski said it’s because now that we are on 12 hour shifts we require less physical bodies to put on the road to meet our staffing desires. Deputy Mayor Smith said that was a good savings in dollars. Mr. Chodkowski said when he ran the numbers, he missed an employee that we are in the process of hiring; he thought maybe Mr. Gillian had caught it and he knows Chief Reiss did so that may be the reason we are off. He said he would have to verify and it could be missing 1 officer; he will validate the numbers.

Ms. Campbell said under police on the budget notes, County Jail Housing fees, do we pay that. Mr. Chodkowski said yes. Ms. Campbell asked why that wasn’t included in their fines. Mr. Chodkowski said what the judge does or does not assign is not for him to decide, he is simply required to pay when the county sends us the bill. Deputy Mayor Smith said not everyone is found guilty after we arrest them so sometimes there is no fine. Mrs. Reynolds said if you arrest them, you have to feed them and bed them.

Mr. Schock said regarding the Law Department and the tremendous difference in fees, is that something we should discuss in executive session. Mr. Chodkowski said to the extent we are having the discussion related to the budget, the general fees are based on year to date and labor is the same. He said labor fluctuates with how happy or unhappy the work force is. He said in relation to ongoing litigation that number is reflective of the fees discussed in executive session related to Riverside v. Ohio. Mr. Schock said one of the things he has been saying for 4 years is that we should try to negotiate the Law Director’s contract and have her attend at least 1 meeting per month. He said we have someone we employ here and we never see her except when we really need her. Mayor Flaute said she is an hourly wage; that’s why. Mr. Schock said we can re-negotiate; most cities have their Law Director sitting in the council chambers with them. Mayor Flaute said he thought that was silly. Mr. Denning said he’s been on council 2 years and he can think of 1 time when it might have moved things along a little quicker to have the Law Director here. He said he didn’t think it would be cost effective to do that. Mr. Schock said without the Law Director sitting there, how many mistakes are we making without realizing it until later on down the line – mistakes of protocol and so on? Mr. Denning said protocol would not be the Law Director. Mr. Schock said one of us would catch it; that’s what you are depending on. He said in his early years of being an elected official, he was used to having a Law Director at his back. Mr. Denning said that was then and this is now.

Mrs. Reynolds asked how many more principal payments we had on the fire station. Mr. Chodkowski said not many. Mr. Gillian said it pays off in 2015. Mr. Chodkowski said you are still paying on Station 6 and this addition which was wrapped into the 10 year bond. Mrs. Reynolds said she knows there is a list of what is included in the 10 year bond but she couldn’t find it. Mr. Gillian said most of it is Station 6 and the Business Park and there are small amounts for this addition and the sidewalk bond. Mr. Schock asked if council could get a copy of the list.

Mr. Fullenkamp asked if we renegotiated with DP&L for the Center of Flight utilities; it dropped from $18,500 to $10,000. Mr. Schock asked if we changed the lighting district. Mr. Chodkowski said its 2 things: the Finance Department assured him he was too conservative in his expense estimates last year, so we budgeted a little high; and then in April we signed a new contract for lower rates. He said it is a combination of those two things.

Deputy Mayor Smith said going back to the fire expenses we have a fire station principal payment of $120,000 and fire station interest payment of $19,000, giving a subtotal of debt of $139,000. He asked when do we ever pay down on that principal. Mr. Chodkowski said it will be paid off in 2015. Deputy Mayor Smith asked if we were making a principal payment in 2012. Mr. Chodkowski said yes, $120,000. Deputy Mayor Smith asked where the balance of what we owe is listed. Mr. Chodkowski said you can find that on the audit report.

Deputy Mayor Smith said on page 2 of the budget notes there is $1,000 to winterize Rohrer Park concession stand; that’s a lot of money and shouldn’t the church do that since they are using it. Mr. Chodkowski said the church does pay a prorate based on square footage but we don’t pass on the cost of the winterization to them because we would do it whether the church was there or not and we do utilize the common room for other purposes. Deputy Mayor Smith said that is pretty expensive; he’s had gas lines installed in houses for $800. Mr. Chodkowski said part of the reason we don’t do it is because in 2008, we did do it ourselves and we missed a line that did blow out. He said we would prefer to be safe rather than sorry.

Mrs. Reynolds asked if there was any fluff in the budget at all. Mr. Chodkowski said no; we obviously round to the nearest 100 so there could be 100 here and there but nothing significant. Mrs. Reynolds asked if he was on the high side for health insurance premiums. Mr. Chodkowski said we accounted for a 10% increase in premiums and direct expensed per plan per employee so we did not account for anyone getting married or divorced. He said we do not have our experience rating back yet which will be at the tail end of October; based on the typical increase our rates have gone up 9 to 9 ½ % and this is budgeted for 10%. He said it could be more or it could be less; it depends on what our experience is.

Mrs. Reynolds said she saw no revenue under estate taxes. Mr. Chodkowski said that will be gone in 2013 but our take historically has been all over the board. Mr. Gillian said they have advised us to eliminate that from our budget. Mr. Chodkowski said in 2013 we will no longer be able to collect that. Mayor Flaute said Mr. Kasich is bragging about that.

Mayor Flaute said so the budget presented tonight is going to put us in the hole $1,508,347. Mr. Chodkowski said that’s about right and it should be noted that doesn’t include any withdraws for Harshman/Valley or for capital equipment. Mrs. Reynolds said it’s actually about $3.0 Million. Mr. Chodkowski said depending upon what breaks and what doesn’t break, that’s about right.

Deputy Mayor Smith asked if we had a fire truck we were looking at replacing soon. Mr. Chodkowski said lucky for us they are all working the way they should; they are a little older and wiser but they still put out the fires. He said the one issue is the medics, if we continue to garner a revenue benefit with the fourth medic in service, he advised Acting Chief Turner to submit an application for a SAFER Grant which pays 50% for another medic. He said we are hoping that will garner positive response but if not we may be able to delay that purchase one more year. He said he believes a medic is duly needed; we just sent the backhoe off for $6,000 worth of maintenance on the front bucket which has been an ongoing issue so we will probably have to look at that as well and we will have to tabulate mileage on the remaining police cruisers in our fleet. Deputy Mayor Smith said back in the old days we had a fire truck that was older and wiser and he did his job, he was a good fire truck but had a hole in the tank. He said once we got to the fire house, all we had to do is follow the trail of water to the fire.

Ms. Campbell said she was looking for revenues from fines and fees. Mr. Chodkowski said most of that goes to the court; we get about 5 to 7 cents on every dollar the court fines. Ms. Campbell said does it go to the county. Mr. Chodkowski said the court takes their cut, the county gets their cut, and whatever is left over comes to us. Ms. Campbell said when we switch dispatch over to Huber Heights, are we going to switch courts. Mr. Chodkowski said no; he did have several conversations with Huber Height’s City Manager Gary Adams as well as Vandalia City Manager Rob Anderson regarding municipal court, to move all our criminal prosecutions and all our criminal charges to be processed through another municipal court with the belief more of the dollars could come back our way. He said in order for that to happen the state legislature would have to pass a law amending the jurisdiction of Vandalia Municipal Court to include the City of Riverside in addition to which the judges in the court system are relatively independent of the municipalities they serve, so there would be no return benefit to us. Ms. Campbell asked if we could get a read out from them of all the people that have been to court, what they paid, and what we got out of it. Mr. Chodkowski said what we got out of it is what’s listed - $750. Ms. Campbell said she knows we’ve had a lot of busts and we get nothing. Mr. Chodkowski said anything significant such as taking down a drug house and confiscating money, it would show up in another fund such as the drug law fund or DUI. Ms. Campbell asked who got that money. Mr. Chodkowski said we would get the majority depending on how many organizations were involved; if they are part of the operation, all that gets split.

Mr. Denning said the way for us to get fees is for us to put up red light cameras and we weren’t willing to do that. Deputy Mayor Smith said you only get 30%. Mr. Denning said that’s better than 5%.

Mr. Schock said why don’t we look at hiring our own magistrate and having our own court like we used to have in the township? He said that would be 100% and all we have to do is hire a clerk and the magistrate. Mr. Chodkowski said the short version is it could be done; we would basically set up a Mayor’s Court which can be done by ordinance and once the court is established, you would appoint by resolution a magistrate who would serve in your capacity as the adjudicator of the Mayor’s Court. He said our prosecutor would come in and handle those cases that would be eligible to come before a Mayor’s Court and in almost all instances those would be traffic violations. Mr. Fullenkamp asked if it would be a profitable approach. Mayor Flaute asked if the Mayor was allowed to be the magistrate. Mr. Chodkowski said you would have to have the required training to do that and to have you serve; the liability insurance would kill us. He said in order for it to be cost effective just in concept, you would need a magistrate to serve, someone who is a practitioner of law.

Mr. Schock said the magistrate could also handle criminal. Mr. Chodkowski said that would be municipal court and would require an act of the general assembly to establish. He said we would also lose all control because the judge wouldn’t be appointed by council, the judge would be elected by the citizenry and then they would become beholden to cover their costs to operate the court.

Mr. Schock said we just have to go with what Mr. Denning stated and we’ve talked about it before - the cameras; the revenue will be a plus on that but we also going to find out that it will lower the accident rate. He said he left it up to the City Manager to put on the agenda. Mr. Chodkowski said it is on the agenda in November.

Deputy Mayor Smith said on the revenue for the Police Fund under school resource officer; last year we received $37,000 but in 2012, we don’t have anyone scheduled for that. Mr. Chodkowski said correct; we don’t have the body to devote to that position. Deputy Mayor Smith asked if the benefit for the officer being on the road outweighed the benefit from the officer being in school. Mr. Chodkowski said from a cost perspective no it was not; while the school resource officer was nice to have and we were able to gather intelligence through his position, the return on investment for the cost in relation to the crime we were able to become knowledgeable of and to prevent was minimal. Deputy Mayor Smith said didn’t a child bring a gun to school. Mr. Chodkowski said there was an instance of a threat to bring a gun to school and his understanding was that information came to the department outside of school hours and not necessarily through the resource officer. He said he would have to verify that but he is aware of the instance you are talking about. He said unfortunately, it is a nice position to have but it is not essential for us to be able to perform our function and right now with times the way they are, we have to be focused on doing our essential functions very well. Deputy Mayor Smith said he thought it was a good thing to have at the schools. Mr. Schock said he thought so too.

Ms. Campbell said don’t we benefit from the police going to the school more than the officers being out writing zoning tickets. She said wouldn’t it be better if they went to the schools and gain revenue from that. Mr. Chodkowski said he didn’t believe so; it;s not so much that we gain revenue from that but on Friday at 10:00 during 4th period we find out about the kegger somebody is throwing that night. He said he would like to believe our department is skilled enough that they would be able to bust up a high school keg party regardless of where they got the information. Ms. Campbell said she still doesn’t see why they are doing zoning; we have zoning people for that.

Mrs. Reynolds said we’ve talked this evening and we are at the point where we are $3.0 Million more in expenses over revenues; adding in the Harshman Road $1.5 Million, leaving us roughly $5.0 Million in the bank to deal with. She said looking at expenses vs. revenues that gives us about 3 years out, correct? Mr. Chodkowski said yes, give or take. Mrs. Reynolds said 3 years before we are broke. Mr. Chodkowski said we’ll have budgetary fiscal conditions prior to that but yes; that is correct. Mrs. Reynolds said that’s what we have to keep in mind.

Deputy Mayor Smith said we haven’t agreed to repair any roads yet so we still have all our money in the bank. Mr. Chodkowski said if the grant comes through, you have agreed to the grant and then some on the mill and fill.

Mr. Denning asked what .5% income tax would give us per year. Mr. Chodkowski said about $1.1 Million. Mr. Denning said so that doesn’t equal what we are down for the year but it would be a good start.

Mr. Chodkowski said just a couple of food for thought items comparing 2007 actual to 2012 projections, just in that time period: the fund balance in the general fund has increased 121%; income tax is down 14.5 %; property tax is down almost 18%; our total operating expense has increased just over 1%; total personnel expense increased 18%; and total operating expense has decreased 16.8%. Mayor Flaute said if anybody says we are not being fiscally responsible they not speaking the truth. Mr. Chodkowski said the Local Government Fund has decreased almost 35%; total revenue is down 22% and total operation has increased just over 1%. Mrs. Reynolds said let’s call the state and they’ll attach that to the appropriation to help us. Mr. Chodkowski said we are as efficient as all get out.

Mayor Flaute said he just thinks it is important to let the citizens know we are very fiscally responsible and if they’ve heard we’re not, that’s not true.

Mr. Chodkowski said his to do’s from this meeting are to validate the Police Department personnel calculations and Mrs. Reynolds and Mr. Schock asked for the 10 year bond information.

Ms. Campbell asked if we have less people in the Police Department. Mr. Chodkowski said yes but there are more officers on the road now. Ms. Campbell asked how many officers we have. Mr. Chodkowski said including the Chief and Deputy Chief, 29. Ms. Campbell asked how many we are supposed to maintain. Mr. Chodkowski said we are committed to 27.

Deputy Mayor Smith asked for a brief explanation about the 2012 Proposed Budget Fund Summary Information sheet. Mr. Chodkowski said Mrs. Reynolds sent some questions regarding clarification of balances in certain funds; we talked about there was $8.5 Million in the bank but you could only spend $7.5 Million, how that is all broken down, where we are gaining and where we are losing. He said Mr. Gillian put together this spread sheet to summarize that information for you.

Mr. Schock asked if union negotiations determine how many firefighters we have on the job. Mr. Chodkowski said our collective bargaining units do not do that. Mr. Schock said he was just wondering because of some literature he received and he could never remember that in negotiations as long as he was an elected official. Mr. Denning said some cities do.

**ITEM 8: ADJOURNMENT:** A motion was made by Mr. Denning to adjourn. Ms. Campbell seconded the motion. All were in favor; none were opposed. The meeting was adjourned at 8:07 p.m.

**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

William R. Flaute, Mayor Clerk of Council